Official Translation

I, Dora O. De Guillemin, Official Translator of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Costa Rica, nominated by decree number 210 - D.P. of June 4, 1975, published in La Gaceta Number 112 on June 17, 1975, hereby certify that the document (copy) written in Spanish and to be translated, SAYS:

"MINISTRY OF PUBLIC EDUCATION. National Council for Superior Private University Education. P.O. Box 10087-1000, San Jose, Costa Rica. Telephone: 233-9050. Fax: 233-6118. CIRCULAR. Number 270-98-CONESUP. April 28, 1998. [Handwritten note* illegible]. To the Presidents of Private Universities: Dear Presidents: During the session number 343-98, article nine, held on February 19, 1998, ATJ-167-CONESUP was taken up. The same refers to the right of private universities to establish conventions of inter-institutional character which is being accepted by the Council. In view of the importance and the significance of the criteria issued by the Legal Expert Advisory it is considered adequate to inform the university authorities so that they observe the terms of this disposition when defining inter-institutional conventions. Sincerely yours, [Signature illegible] Donaldo Jimenez Cascante, General Secretary. [Stamp: Illegible] Grace S. Attachment: Document of reference. MINISTRY OF PUBLIC EDUCATION. Legal Expert Advisory Service. San Jose. CONESUP: Received [Signature illegible]. Date: 17-11-98. Consecutive: 177-98. Hour 11:30 a.m. ATJ-167-CONESUP: April 14, 1997. Mr. Donaldo Jimenez C., General Secretary, CONESUP. Present, Dear Sir With reference to the official letters which refer to the topic to be indicated I present the statement referring to the request formulated by CONESUP regarding "...if private universities may establish conventions and transfer their courses of study to Para-University entities or entities of a different character...". There are basically three possibilities for Para-Universities to establish conventions as there are: a. Private University - Para-University institution, b. Private University - National private university, c. Private University - Foreign private university. A. PRIVATE UNIVERSITY - PARA-UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTION. Article 2 of the Law No. 6541-80 defines the Para-University institutions for superior education as "...those accepted by the Superior Council of Education and the main objective of which is to offer complete, short courses of study lasting two or three years to people who have graduated from the diversified education. The level of the courses of study of Para-University superior education is average and lies between the diversified education and the superior university education." Article 18 of the same body of law determines that "these centers of education are authorized to establish conventions of cooperation or exchange of services and technology with public or private institutions both national and foreign." Finally, number 3 of the decree No. 12711-E-81 (Regulation of superior Para-University Education) establishes that "in order to achieve their aims, the institutions of superior, Para-University education shall comply with the following functions: (...) offer academic activities based on conventions and exchange of services and technology with other institutions...."

In view of the previous interrelation of norms, it is being concluded that the Para-University institutions may establish conventions of cooperation with private universities, mainly when the same concern means for education such as laboratories or infrastructure. However, under no circumstances can such conventions establish clauses which imply the "transfer" or the "assignment of an academic offer as such of a private university to a Para-University institution. In the first place, the superior Para-University education was not only designed with distinct aims as established in its Regulating Law but also grants different academic levels by accrediting their conclusion with the "Pre-degree" or "associated degree" according to the Convention in order to create a Nomenclature of degrees and titles for the Superior Costa Rican Education of the "diploma". It is therefore of interest to set out that: "The degree includes all those courses of study which have been called "short". There are two types of the same: the terminal courses and the none-terminal courses of study. The first ones are structured in a way that they do not constitute a stage for the continuation of studies on a degree level. The second ones are lateral graduations of the courses of study which lead to the degree and which in the
degree course syllabus represent a stage for the continuation of the studies which lead to the degree and in some cases to the postgraduate degree. The graduates of both types of the courses of study shall be referred to as "qualified". (Convention for the creation of a Nomenclature of Degrees and Titles for the Superior Costa Rican Education). B. PRIVATE UNIVERSITY - PRIVATE NATIONAL UNIVERSITY. Article 8 of the Law No. 6693-81 establishes that "once its operation has been authorized, the private university shall have to liberty to develop its academic activities and curriculum as well as its study plans and programs...". Numeral 9 of the same body of law determines that "within the terms of this law, the private universities as institutions of superior education shall enjoy total liberty with regard to the curriculum, scientific research and the diffusion of culture...". Based on an harmonious interpretation of these two norms, the private universities could establish conventions of cooperation among themselves within a framework similar to the one that has already been set out for the Para-University Institutions, i.e. the exchange of services and means of education. However, it would be totally adversary to the law to pretend that this way, academic offers are being "exchanged", "transferred" or "assigned" among universities. Consequently, these centers of education enjoy the "total liberty" to develop their activities "within the regulations of this law". This means that if an academic offer is being authorized to a determined university, only this university may develop the same in conformity with the same elements which form and justify it and which were the ones which constitute the requirements under which the Administration framed its activity and in virtue of which a notification was issued guaranteeing the competence of the offer in question towards third parties. All this technical and effective framework would vary substantially if one of the essential elements of the academic offer, such as the responsible authority of the same, changed with not only the approval in virtue of which the offer holds its "official" character becoming automatically invalid but furthermore, we would be faced with an offer totally different from the one submitted for consideration on behalf of the Administration thus "unknown" to the same and, as a logical consequence, without the approval sustaining it. C. PRIVATE UNIVERSITY -
PRIVATE FOREIGN UNIVERSITY. In cases where the academic offer is being
developed outside of the national territory CONESUP does not have any
authority whatsoever. This means that the powers of article 3 of its Law of
Establishment and those conferred by means of the Constitutional article 79 limit
the activity of superior private university education within our borders. However, it
should be mentioned that if the offer is being developed abroad, the diploma
which accredits the academic degree in question may not be approved on behalf
of CONESUP. As a matter of fact, the private national university which plans to
expand outside of our country shall have to submit itself to the corresponding
procedures within the legal regulations which support the same and with which
CONESUP does not have any relation or interference of any kind. In the second
place, this circumstance of "the expansion" causes the absolute impossibility of
authorization and inspection of the development of the academic offer. Thus, the
Administration can not guarantee the professional formation of a student by
officially acknowledging his studies by approving his title without mentioning the
territoriality itself of said authorities which has already been explained above.
Sincerely yours, [Signature illegible] Lic. Fabiola Cantero Acosta. [Stamp:
Personal archive."

In witness hereof I issue the above translation from Spanish into English,
consisting of four pages. I sign and add my stamp in the town of San Jose, on
the seventeenth of August of the year two thousand and four.
FOREIGN UNIVERSITY.

In cases where the academic offer is binding, the University's academic authorities are responsible for determining the type of degree or title to be awarded. This means that the power of affixing the University's seal to diplomas and certificates lies with the University's authorities. However, if the activity of conducting academic degrees in foreign universities or other higher education institutions is being developed outside of the national territory, CONESUP must authorize such activity. CONESUP must also ensure that the foreign degree or title awarded by the institution is equivalent to a degree or title offered by a university in Peru. The foreign institution must submit its proposal to CONESUP for approval. If CONESUP approves the proposal, the foreign degree or title may be awarded by the institution in Peru.

The University's academic authorities must accept the foreign degrees and titles in the same way they accept their own degrees and titles. The foreign degrees and titles must meet the same requirements as the degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru. The University's academic authorities must also ensure that the foreign degrees and titles are recognized by the Peruvian government.

CONESUP must also ensure that the foreign degrees and titles are accredited by the Peruvian government. This accreditation must be based on the equivalence of the foreign degrees and titles with degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru. The foreign degrees and titles must meet the same requirements as the degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru.

The University's academic authorities must also ensure that the foreign degrees and titles are recognized by the Peruvian government. This recognition must be based on the equivalence of the foreign degrees and titles with degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru. The foreign degrees and titles must meet the same requirements as the degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru.

The University's academic authorities must also ensure that the foreign degrees and titles are accredited by the Peruvian government. This accreditation must be based on the equivalence of the foreign degrees and titles with degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru. The foreign degrees and titles must meet the same requirements as the degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru.

The University's academic authorities must also ensure that the foreign degrees and titles are recognized by the Peruvian government. This recognition must be based on the equivalence of the foreign degrees and titles with degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru. The foreign degrees and titles must meet the same requirements as the degrees and titles offered by universities in Peru.
Republica de Costa Rica

Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto

La firma que antecede del señor:

Dona O. de Guillén

Conductora Oficial

San José, 29 Sep 2004

Esta autenticación no implica responsabilidad en cuanto al contenido del documento.

Erika Palacios Sole

Escribanía Pública

C. Notarial 19-2003

ES COPIA FIEL DE SU ORIGINAL.
CIRCULAR
No. 276-98-CONESUP

Senedores
Rectores
Universidades Privadas

Estimados señores Rectores:

En la sesión No. 434-98, artículo noveno, celebrada el 19 de febrero, 1998, se conoció el ATJ-167-CONESUP, relativo a la capacidad de las universidades privadas para establecer convenios de carácter interinstitucional, el cual acoge el Consejo.

Por la importancia y trascendencia del criterio emitido por la Asesoría Técnica Jurídica, consideró pertinente hacerlo del conocimiento de las autoridades universitarias, con la finalidad de que tomen en cuenta los términos de esta disposición al definir convenios interinstitucionales.

Atentamente,

[Signature]

[Position]

Anexo: Documento en referencia.
educación superior parauniversitaria en intermedio, entre la educación diversificada y la educación superior universitaria.

Por su parte, el artículo 18 de ese mismo cuerpo legal dispone que "esos centros educativos quedan facultados para establecer convenios de cooperación o intercambio de servicios y tecnología con las instituciones públicas o privadas, tanto nacionales como extranjeras".

Finalmente, el numeral 3 del Decreto No. 12711-E-81 (Reglamento de la Educación Superior Parauniversitaria) establece que "para lograr sus fines, las instituciones de educación superior parauniversitaria cumplirán las siguientes funciones: (...) ofrecer actividades académicas con base en convenios e intercambio de servicios y tecnología con otras instituciones ...".

De la anterior interrelación de normas, se colige que las instituciones parauniversitarias podrían establecer convenios de cooperación con universidades privadas, sobre todo en tratándose de recursos para la enseñanza, tales como laboratorios o infraestructura.

Empero, de ninguna forma pueden estipularse en tales convenios cláusulas que impliquen la "transferencia" o "cesión" de una oferta académica como tal, de una universidad privada a una institución parauniversitaria.

Así, y en primer lugar, la educación superior parauniversitaria no solamente fue concebida con fines distintos -tal y como se estableció en su Ley Regulatoria- sino que otorga condiciones académicas diferentes, al acreditarse la conclusión de la misma con el "pre-grado" o "grado asociado" -según referencia al Convenio para crear una Nomenclatura de Grados y Títulos en la Educación Superior Costarricense- de "diplomado".

Al efecto, resulta de interés acotar que:

"El grado incluye a todas aquellas carreras a las que se ha llamado "cortas". Dentro de ellas se dan dos tipos: las terminales y las no terminales. Las primeras están estructuradas de manera tal que no constituyen un peldaño para continuar..."

ES COPIA FIEL DE SU ORIGINAL.

[Signature]

ERIKA PALACIOS SOLE
ESCRIBANA PÚBLICA
C. Notarial 18,286.
estudios a nivel de grado. Las segundas constituyen salidas laterales de las carreras que conducen a un grado y son en los planes de estudio un peldaño para continuar estudios que conduzcan al grado y en algunos casos al posgrado. A los graduados de ambos tipos de carrera se les denominará “diplomados”.

(Convenio para crear una Nomenclatura de Grados y Títulos en la Educación Superior Costarricense).

B) UNIVERSIDAD PRIVADA-UNIVERSIDAD PRIVADA NACIONAL

El artículo 8 de la Ley No.6693-81 establece que “una vez autorizado su funcionamiento, la universidad privada tendrá libertad para desarrollar sus actividades académicas y docentes, y para el desenvolvimiento de sus planes y programas de estudio...”.

Por su parte, el numeral 9 de ese mismo cuerpo legal dispone que “dentro de los términos de esta ley las universidades privadas, como instituciones de enseñanza superior, gozarán de plena libertad para la docencia, la investigación científica y la difusión de la cultura...”.

De una interpretación armónica de estas dos normas, tendríamos que las universidades privadas podrán establecer convenios de cooperación entre sí, dentro de un marco similar al ya expuesto para las instituciones parauniversitarias, sea, de intercambio de servicios y recursos para la enseñanza.

Sin embargo, resultaría totalmente contrario a Derecho pretender que -por esta vía- se “intercambien”, “transfieran” o “cedan” ofertas académicas entre universidades. Así, resulta que estos centros de enseñanza gozan de “plena libertad” para el desarrollo de sus actividades “dentro de los términos de esta ley”; es decir, si una oferta académica es autorizada a una universidad determinada, ella y solamente ella puede desarrollarla, en conformidad con los elementos mismos que la componen y justifican y que fueron los que -precisamente- constituyen los supuestos bajo los cuales la Administración enmarcó su actividad y en virtud de los cuales emitió un acto avalando -frente a terceros- la idoneidad de la oferta en cuestión.
Todo este marco técnico-fáctico variaría sustancialmente si uno de los elementos esenciales de la oferta académica, como lo es el ente responsable de la misma, cambia, invalidándose automáticamente no sólo el acto aprobatorio en virtud del cual la oferta reviste su carácter de "oficial" sino que, además, estaríamos frente a una oferta totalmente diferente a la sometida a consideración de la Administración; por ende, "desconocida" por ésta y, como resulta lógico, sin un acto de aprobación que la sustente.

C. UNIVERSIDAD PRIVADA - UNIVERSIDAD PRIVADA EXTRANJERA

Para los casos en los que la oferta académica se desarrolla fuera del territorio nacional, el CONESUP no tiene competencia alguna; es decir, las potestades del artículo 3 de su Ley de creación y las conferidas por el artículo 79 Constitucional se constituyen a la actividad de educación superior universitaria privada que se da dentro de nuestras fronteras.

En todo caso, vale acotar que, si la oferta se desarrolla en el exterior, el diploma que acredita el grado académico que se trate no es susceptible de referendo por parte del CONESUP. En efecto, y para empezar, la universidad privada nacional que pretenda expandirse fuera de nuestro país deberá someterse a los procedimientos correspondientes en el ordenamiento jurídico que los sustenta, frente a los cuales el CONESUP no tiene relación ni ingencia alguna. En segundo lugar, resulta de esta circunstancia -"la expansión"- la imposibilidad absoluta de autorización y de inspección del desarrollo de la oferta académica, con lo que no podría la Administración avalar la formación profesional de un alumno otorgándole el reconocimiento oficial de sus estudios a través del referendo de su título, sin mencionar la territorialidad misma de dichas competencias, ya explicitada supra.

Atención particular
Lic. Fabiola Cantero Acosta
C.C. 04710
Archivo personal

MINISTERIO DE EDUCACIÓN PÚBLICA
ASESORÍA TÉCNICO JURÍDICA
COSTA RICA

ES COPIA FIEL DE SU ORÍGINAL